

DELIBERATIVE CAFÉ

RULEBOOK

Table of Contents

Section 1. What is a Deliberative Café?	2
Section 2. Management	2
Section 3. Assembly Members	3
Section 4. Random selection	4
Section 5. Rights of Assembly Members	5
Section 6. Experts	6
Section 7. Stakeholders	7
Section 8. Facilitators	9
Section 9. Observers	10
Section 10. Developing recommendations	10
Section 11. Final vote	11
Section 12. Impact	13

Section 1. What is a Deliberative Café?

1. The Deliberative Café is a process of public consultations with a randomly selected and demographically representative group of citizens that is based on the principles of deliberative democracy.
2. The aim of the Deliberative Café is better decision-making. It provides insights from citizens and it allows for a better understanding of the perspective of citizens with regards to the topic it is dealing with.
3. Conversation guidelines of the Deliberative Café include the following principles:
 - 1) Respecting each other;
 - 2) Being open for a diversity of perspectives and points of view;
 - 3) Listening with openness and curiosity.

Section 2. Management

1. Deliberative Café is run by the Coordinating Team.
2. The Coordinating Team is impartial and independent in decision-making related to their tasks. Members of the Coordinating Team cannot be active politicians, civil servants or direct stakeholders.
3. The tasks of the Coordinating Team include:
 - 1) designing the random selection process;
 - 2) updating the Rulebook, if need be;
 - 3) providing a website for registration of citizens willing to participate in the Deliberative Café;
 - 4) conducting final random selection;
 - 5) contacting Assembly Members;
 - 6) conducting an open recruitment of Stakeholders;
 - 7) selecting Experts;
 - 8) preparing the program of the meetings of the Assembly;
 - 9) organising all meetings of the Assembly;

- 10) selecting Facilitators;
 - 11) conducting the final voting on the proposals for recommendations;
 - 12) preparing the list of final recommendations.
4. In organising the Deliberative Café, the Coordinating Team is supported by the City Hall. The tasks of the City Hall include:
 - 1) preparing the database for the first random selection;
 - 2) conducting first random selection of citizens who will receive letters with invitations;
 - 3) sending letters with invitations;
 - 4) organising the households visits for in-person invitations;
 - 5) providing registration by phone;
 - 6) organising an informational campaign about the Deliberative Café.
 5. Coordinating Team members make decisions at their own discretion within their agreed roles. At the request of any of its members, a particularly pivotal matter may require a joint decision of the entire Team.
 6. The Coordinating Team may make decisions on matters unaddressed in the Rulebook.
 7. The Coordinating Team may be supported by the Guiding Team of experienced coordinators of deliberative processes or an individual consultant.

Section 3. Assembly Members

1. The Assembly in the Deliberative Café consists of 36 Assembly Members.
2. To become a Assembly Member, one must meet the following eligibility criteria:
 - 1) be a citizen of the city where the Deliberative Café is taking place;
 - 2) be at least 18 years old;
 - 3) receive a personal invitation to participate or live in a household which received an invitation to participate (depending on the selected method for inviting citizens);
 - 4) confirm their willingness to participate in the Deliberative Café.

3. The composition of the Assembly reflects the demographic structure of the city in terms of at least the following criteria:
 - 1) gender;
 - 2) age group:
 - a) 18-24 years,
 - b) 25-39 years,
 - c) 40-64 years,
 - d) 65+ years;
 - 3) level of education;
 - 4) city area.
4. The following persons are not eligible to become Assembly Members:
 - 1) persons in the City Administration:
 - holding managerial positions;
 - working in areas related to the subject of the Deliberative Café;
 - 2) persons holding managerial positions in public organisational units of city;
 - 3) elected politicians and political appointees, including their advisors;
 - 4) lobbyists working in an area related to the topic of the Deliberative Café;
 - 5) members of the Stakeholders' groups, including board members;
 - 6) employees of the Stakeholders' groups connected with the topic of the Deliberative Café;
 - 7) members of the Coordinating Team and Guiding Team;
 - 8) Experts, Observers, or Facilitators.

Section 4. Random selection

1. All Assembly Members are selected at random.
2. Random selection is carried out in two stages: the first is inviting randomly selected citizens to participate, and the second is selecting at random the final Assembly.

3. Invitations to participate in the Deliberative Café are sent out to randomly selected 2000 individuals or 2000 households, depending on the available data.
4. A full list of eligible individuals or a list of all households is taken into account for the first stage of random selection.
5. A letter with invitation includes extended information about the process, such as answers to Frequently Asked Questions.
6. From the group of individuals or households that were selected to receive invitations, 200 are selected at random for household visits for personal invitations. Random selection for household visits may include a mechanism of giving a boost, in terms of the number of invitations, to the areas of the city where those who are less likely to participate in public events live.
7. Citizens may register to participate in the Deliberative Café via the website or by phone.
8. The final stage of selecting Assembly Members uses an analogue method of random selection (e.g., rolling dice), and is transmitted live and recorded.

Section 5. Rights of Assembly Members

1. Each Assembly Member has the right to:
 - 1) take part in all meetings organised as part of the Deliberative Café;
 - 2) ask questions of presenters during the meetings, within the time allowed;
 - 3) request additional opinions from Experts and Stakeholders between meetings. Such requests are handled by the Coordinating Team;
 - 4) submit proposals for recommendations;
 - 5) participate in the discussion about the recommendations;
 - 6) submit motions to verify the accuracy of information that appears in the discussion (fact-checking);
 - 7) participate in the final vote on recommendations, subject to item 2;
 - 8) submit motions to invite additional Experts;
 - 9) submit motions to replace a Facilitator;
 - 10) submit motions for additional meetings of the Assembly;
 - 11) receive a stipend for their participation in the Deliberative Café;

- 12) keep their identity private.
2. In order to participate in the final voting, Assembly Members must take part in at least two meetings of the Deliberative Café.
3. If an Assembly Member submits a motion to verify the accuracy of information that is presented during the Deliberative Café, fact-checking is provided by the Coordinating Team. Responses are presented to all Assembly Members orally or in writing.
4. Assembly Members may contact Experts and Stakeholders only during the meetings of the Deliberative Café or via the Coordinating Team.
5. The identity of the Assembly Members may only be published after the process has ended.

Section 6. Experts

1. Expert is a person who specialises in the subject of the Deliberative Café, by profession, education, training, skill or experience, and whose role is to transfer that knowledge to the Assembly Members.
2. Persons with insights on the Deliberative Café topic, by virtue of first-hand life experiences, may be invited to participate in the Deliberative Café as Witnesses along with Experts.
3. Three Experts are selected by the Coordinating Team who takes into account the diversity of perspectives that will be presented. One Expert is selected by the City Hall and it may be a civil servant.
4. The tasks of Experts include:
 - 1) giving a presentation during a learning phase;
 - 2) taking part in a conversation with Assembly Members during small group discussions;
 - 3) preparing written materials containing a summary of the presentation and proposals for recommendations;
 - 4) preparing other written educational materials for the Assembly Members;
 - 5) giving opinions on the recommendations prepared by the Assembly Members and other Experts.
5. An Expert may choose to provide the materials referred to in item 5, points 2-4 without making a presentation.

6. The time allocated for the introductory presentation of each Expert is 12 minutes.
7. Time allocated for the small group discussions with Experts is 30 minutes.
8. Up to 8 additional Experts may be selected by the Coordinating Team to prepare statements in writing (up to 5600 characters including spaces) that may include both key learning points as well as proposals for recommendations.
9. Assembly Members may decide to invite up to two additional speakers for the second meeting. These persons can be either Experts or Stakeholders. Every Assembly Member may submit a proposal for inviting up to two additional speakers.
10. Assembly Members decide upon inviting additional speakers by voting. Assembly Members cast their vote by selecting one of the options based on the method described in section 11.
11. Inviting each additional speaker requires an approval of at least a simple majority of Assembly Members participating in the vote. If there are more than two proposals for additional speakers, those two who received the highest total number of points are considered as invited for the meeting.
12. Experts may provide additional longer presentations in the form of recordings and/or other materials.
13. Experts are entitled to compensation for taking part in the Deliberative Café.

Section 7. Stakeholders

1. A Stakeholder is an organisation, institution, or an informal group of people whose activity is related to the subject of the Deliberative Café, or which is directly affected by issues raised during the Deliberative Café.
2. The Coordinating Team draws up a list of parties of interest, which it invites to participate in the Deliberative Café. The invitees should confirm their participation via e-mail by the date specified in the invitation.
3. Stakeholders who have not been invited to participate in the Deliberative Café may notify the Coordinating Team about their interest in participating per the instructions and by the deadline posted on the Deliberative Café's website. In their application, the Stakeholders should demonstrate that they meet the prerequisites specified in item 1.
4. Stakeholders must confirm their participation in the Deliberative Café until the date posted on the website of the Deliberative Café, subject to item 7.

5. In the event that an entity does not meet the requirements set out in item 3, the Coordinating Team shall reject the application and inform the entity by email.
6. The Coordinating Team may accept participation of the Stakeholder in the Deliberative Café after the deadline that was posted on the Deliberative Café's website for submissions, if it is possible at the given stage of the process.
7. Stakeholders participating in the Deliberative Café have the right to:
 - 1) suggest topics to be covered during the learning phase of the Deliberative Café and/or experts to present them;
 - 2) make an oral presentation during the learning phase, which may include references to the Experts' speeches (subject to a total number of Stakeholders);
 - 3) propose recommendations;
 - 4) provide Assembly Members with a summary of their opinions in a written form (up to 5600 characters including spaces);
 - 5) provide the Assembly Members with their comments on the suggested recommendations by Experts and other Stakeholders in a written form;
 - 6) provide the Assembly Members with additional materials pertaining to the subject of the Deliberative Café.
8. Up to 4 Stakeholders are invited for the meeting of the Assembly.
9. If the number of Stakeholders is larger than 4, Stakeholders are invited to form coalitions and to select 1 representative for each of them. The minimum number of Stakeholders in a coalition is calculated according to the total number of Stakeholders.
10. In case coalitions are not formed, Stakeholders are selected at random.
11. In case some coalitions are formed, Stakeholders who created a coalition are invited for the meeting, while others are selected at random.
12. Time allocated for the introductory presentations of Stakeholders during the learning phase is 6 minutes.
13. The order of the Stakeholders' presentations is selected at random.
14. Time allocated for the small group discussions with Stakeholders is 20 minutes.
15. If the representative of the City Hall is an Expert speaker, then the City Hall does not have another presentation in the time allocated for Stakeholders. In case the City Hall did not have its representative as an Expert speaker, one time slot for the City Hall is granted.

16. Administrative units of the City Hall may present their statements as separate Stakeholders in writing.
17. Stakeholder presentations and proposals for recommendations may be related to the topic of the Deliberative Café only.
18. The Stakeholders shall submit the materials referred to in item 1 points 3-6 to the Coordinating Team.
19. The Coordinating Team may end a live presentation of a Stakeholder before its due time, if it is disrespectful or in other way not in accordance with democratic principles.
20. Materials submitted by the Stakeholders in electronic form are published on the Deliberative Café's website, provided that they are in a respectful form.
21. Representatives of political groups from the City Council are invited for a discussion with the Assembly Members in small groups during the final meeting. The format and time for the discussion are set by the Coordinating Team.
22. The City Hall has the opportunity to present comments to the preliminary recommendation in person during the final meeting of the Assembly. Other speakers for the review phase are selected by the Assembly Members.

Section 8. Facilitators

1. Facilitator is a person who leads the meetings of the Deliberative Café or the discussions in the small groups.
2. A Coordinating Team may act as a Facilitator.
3. The tasks of Facilitators include:
 - 1) conducting the meetings;
 - 2) moderating discussions in the small groups or during the plenary parts.
4. Facilitators may be invited to co-design the meetings of the deliberative phase.
5. The Facilitators are entitled to remuneration for taking part in the Deliberative Café.

Section 9. Observers

1. Those professionally or academically involved with the subject of deliberative democracy and those interested in organising a deliberative process may participate in the plenary sessions of the Deliberative Café as Observers.
2. Observers cannot be Experts or representatives of Stakeholders.
3. Observers may be present during all meetings of the Assembly, however, without the right to participate in discussions or to vote.
4. A request to become an Observer should be sent to the Coordinating Team per the instructions on the website. Requests should be submitted at least one week prior to the relevant meeting and should include an overview of one's background and an explanation of interest.
5. The Coordinating Team may set a total number of Observers for the Deliberative Café.

Section 10. Developing recommendations

1. Recommendation is a resolution that is approved by the Assembly Members with regards to the subject of the Deliberative Café.
2. Proposals for recommendations may be submitted by anyone other than Coordinating Team, Facilitators and Observers.
3. The general public may submit their proposals for recommendations via the website of the Deliberative Café.
4. Experts and Stakeholders submit their proposals for recommendations electronically to the Coordinating Team.
5. Assembly Members submit their proposals for recommendations to the Coordinating Team during the course of the Deliberative Café as specified during the meetings.
6. Proposals for recommendations from the general public, Stakeholders and Experts may be submitted no later than two days before the first meeting of the Assembly, as published in the program on the website. Proposals for recommendations submitted after this day may be accepted with the approval of the Coordinating Team.
7. The Coordinating Team prepares a list of proposed recommendations, submits it to Assembly Members. All submitted proposals are published on the website of the Deliberative Café.

8. Assembly Members can merge proposals for recommendations or create new ones based on submitted proposals.
9. Proposals for recommendations that are not related to the topic of the Deliberative Café may be rejected with at least a simple majority of the Assembly Members participating in the vote.
10. A preliminary vote is taken with regards to proposals for recommendations created during the first day of the deliberative day. Results of the final vote shall be published on the website of the Deliberative Café and sent to the Stakeholders and Experts for consultation (review phase). Anyone may submit comments and/or amendments to the proposed recommendations. All submitted insights are shared with the Assembly Members and published on the website of the Deliberative Café.
11. Before the final vote, the wording of the proposed recommendations is refined. Assembly Members may ask for the support of a professional editor or legalese specialist for this purpose.
12. Assembly Members may make amendments to the proposals for recommendations after the review phase. At this stage, however, developing new proposals for recommendations is no longer possible.
13. A decision whether a particular proposal for recommendation should be considered as new or an amended version of an old proposal is made by the Assembly Members and requires 90 percent agreement.

Section 11. Final vote

1. Voting on recommendations is done by each Assembly Member completing a secret voting ballot.
2. Voting ballots are prepared by the Coordinating Team.
3. Assembly Members cast their vote by selecting one of the following options for each proposal:
 - 1) This is exactly what I want;
 - 2) This is what I want;
 - 3) This is more or less what I want;
 - 4) I have many doubts;
 - 5) This is rather not it;
 - 6) This is not it at all.

where options 1-3 indicate support for the proposals for the recommendation and options 4-6 indicate a lack of support.

4. For each vote, points are granted as follows:
 - 1) This is exactly what I want - 3 points;
 - 2) This is what I want - 2 points;
 - 3) This is more or less what I want - 1 point.
5. An arithmetic mean is calculated for the points granted in accordance with item 4.
6. Voting ballots are prepared by the Coordinating Team and reviewed by Assembly Members.
7. If two or more proposed recommendations have been made that concern the same issue and are mutually exclusive, they are grouped and voting is carried out in accordance with the principles described in items 3-5.
8. A recommendation is considered as approved by the Assembly Members when:
 - 1) it receives the support of at least 80 percent of Assembly Members, and
 - 2) the arithmetic mean of the points granted to it is at least 2.0.
9. If two or more proposals that are mutually exclusive have received the support of at least 80 percent of Assembly Members, the recommendation approved is the one that received the highest total number of points granted according to item 4.
10. If two or more proposals that are mutually exclusive have received the same number of points, they may be discussed and voted on again, until a winning proposal is determined.
11. If the proposal for the recommendation has not received the support of at least 80 percent of Assembly Members, and 2/3 of Assembly Members agree, it is possible to revisit it, amend the proposal and vote again. Voting on a proposed recommendation can take place a maximum of 3 times. In case the level of at least 80 percent of support was not reached, the proposal for the recommendation is considered as not approved.
12. The Coordinating Team can merge proposals for recommendations into blocks, with the consent of the majority of Assembly Members.
13. In case the number of recommendations is larger than 10, a ranked list of recommendations may be created with the ones that received the largest number of points on top and the ones that received the lowest number of points at the bottom.

14. The list of recommendations along with the percentage of support by Assembly Members is published on the website of the Deliberative Café immediately after the official presentation of recommendations.
15. The Deliberative Café concludes when the recommendations have been presented to the public.

Section 12. Impact

1. The City Hall provides a response to all recommendations in writing, within 3 months from receiving them.
2. A response to the recommendations is published on the website of the City Hall and delivered to all Assembly Members.